

Dublin City Council

Audit Committee

**Minutes of Meeting held on 12th July, 2018 at 8.00 a.m.
in the Richard O'Carroll Room, City Hall**

Attendance:

Members

Mr. Brendan Foster, Dublin Chamber of Commerce, Chairperson (BF) (Chair)
Ms. Louise Ryan, Trinity College Dublin (LR)
Mr. Johnny McElhinney, Docklands Business Forum (JMcE)
Mr. Nathy Walsh, Institute of Public Administration (NW)
Lord Mayor Councillor Nial Ring (LM)
Councillor Naoise O Muiri (Cllr. O Muiri)
Deputy Lord Mayor Councillor Cathleen Carney Boud (DLM)

Officials:

Ms. Kathy Quinn, Head of Finance (KQ)
Mr. Hugh Fitzpatrick, Head of Internal Audit (HF)
Ms. Martina Mc Loughlin, Staff Officer, Internal Audit

Also in attendance, to give a presentation on GDPR:

Mr. Terence O'Keeffe, Law Agent (TOK)
Ms. Audrey O'Hara, Senior Solicitor, Law Dept. (AOH)

1. Minutes of Audit Committee meeting held on 8th March, 2018.

HF informed the Members that a response addressing some of the issues raised by the AC was received from the Chief Executive in early May, in relation to the non-implementation of recommendations. The response contrasted significantly with a previous response from the Deputy Chief Executive, Housing Dept. The CE subsequently agreed to provide an amended response to the AC, but this had not been received to date. The Committee expressed their disappointment at the delay and requested HF to request a full response from the CE as soon as possible.

HF informed the Members that the AC Annual Report was approved at the City Council meeting, held in April, 2018.

The Environment & Transportation Risk Register may be available for the September AC meeting.

The minutes were agreed.

Action 1: Chairperson to send a reminder to the CE, on behalf of the AC, requesting a full response in relation to the non-implementation of recommendations, to be forwarded to the AC in advance of their September AC meeting.

2. Standing Item on the agenda – Any Conflict of Interest of A.C. Members

BF informed the Committee that he had accepted the position as Chairperson of the Cherry Orchard Re-Development Group and he wanted this recorded in the minutes “as noted by the AC”.

No conflict of interest declared

3. Appointment by the Elected Council of Deputy Lord Mayor Councillor Cathleen Carney Boud, as a Member of the Audit Committee from 2nd July, 2018 (to fill the vacancy created by the resignation of Councillor Noeleen Reilly)

BF welcomed Cllr. Carney Boud to the Audit Committee. Cllr. Boud informed the Committee that she was elected in 2014 and outlined briefly her background and some of the issues that she would be focussing on and supporting during her term as Deputy Lord Mayor.

The AC acknowledged the work of Councillor Noeleen Reilly on the committee and requested that their appreciation be conveyed to her.

Action 2: HF to convey the appreciation of the AC to Councillor Noeleen Reilly, on her resignation from the committee.

4. Internal Audit Report No. R03/2018: In-Depth Check of the Appraisal/Planning/Design Stage of the Sandford (Clonskeagh) to City Centre Cycle Route (Public Spending Code)

HF informed the AC that the In-Depth Check on the Sandford to City Centre Cycle Route project was carried out per the requirements of the Public Spending Code (PSC) and using the prescribed template. It was suspended in September 2016, due to a lack of funding by the NTA & DCC staffing issues. While some minor recommendations were made, it received a satisfactory rating.

There was a query in relation to the fact that a Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) was carried out, and then the project was paused. HF stated that this project would be re-commencing, and also that the College Green scheme for the Luas Cross City connection had impacted on this project.

KQ stated that while in the context of the project being suspended it was not satisfactory, the In-Depth Check found that governance of the project was acceptable.

5. Internal Audit Report No. R04/2018: In-Depth Check of Dublin City Council's Ongoing Management of Dublin City Car Parking (Public Spending Code)

HF stated that this was an In-Depth Check of revenue expenditure. The contract was awarded in 2011 for a 5 year period, but was extended for a further 2 years. It was well managed, but some improvements are necessary, including governance issues.

The CE was concerned re the KPI issue around the contract, but this will be addressed under the new contract, which should be in place by October 2018.

The committee considered it a detailed and positive report.

A query was raised in relation to a technical issue of not being able to share parking tags on phones. HF to check this and revert to the committee.

Action 3: HF to investigate the possibility of sharing parking tags on mobile phones

6. Internal Audit Report No. R05/2018: In-Depth Check of the Appraisal/Planning/Design Stage of the Dodder Public Transportation Opening Bridge (Public Spending Code)

HF informed the committee that the estimated cost of the project was €32M and it is due to be completed in 2022. It will open up the Poolbeg area and facilitate the provision of approximately 3,000/3,500 housing units. Funding is being provided by the NTA; Dept. of Housing, Planning & Local Government & DCC. A CBA was carried out on the preferred option, instead of all options, as per the PSC.

A query was raised in relation to the annual maintenance cost of €158,000 which was quoted in the report.

The AC acknowledged that it is the IA function to ensure that projects comply with the PSC requirements. HF informed the AC that a Corporate Project Support Office (CPSO) is now in place and they are providing training for the relevant people. The Members were concerned that if there is a lack of compliance with the requirements of the PSC, funding could be jeopardised.

The AC requested that the issue of the format of the PSC reports be raised. KQ will raise it with the County & City Management Association (CCMA).

Action 4: HF check out the annual maintenance cost for the Dodder bridge

Action 5: KQ to raise the issue of the format of PSC reports at the CCMA meeting

**7. Two NOAC reports: Report 15 - Operation of Audit Committees in Local Government
Report 16 - Review of 2015 Statutory Audit Reports to the Members of Local Authorities**

The Committee discussed the two reports.

Report 15 suggested that a network of Chairpersons would be useful for the sharing of good practice and experiences. However, the Committee noted that this had been suggested in early 2005, but nothing has happened since.

The Members also felt that their engagement with the Chief Executive appeared to be low, compared to other Local Authorities. They requested that he be invited to attend the Audit Committee meetings more frequently, perhaps every six months.

Action 6: HF to convey to the Chief Executive that the Audit Committee asked that he attend the AC meetings more frequently

8. Presentation by Terence O'Keeffe, Law Agent and Audrey O'Hara, Senior Solicitor, Law Department, on General Data Protection Regulations (GDPR)

TOK outlined to the AC the requirements of the General Data Protection Regulations for DCC, which includes a Data Breach Policy. He said an awareness campaign is underway for staff and Councillors and software is being reviewed. A Data Protection Commissioner (DPC) is in place.

TOK confirmed to the AC that there was huge awareness in the Organisation in relation to GDPR and that each Department must initiate training for its staff. He stated that, while this is a huge task initially, eventually it will be beneficial for DCC.

9. A.O.B.

The AC congratulated Cllr. Nial Ring on his appointment as Lord Mayor and Cllr. Cathleen Carney Boud on her appointment as Deputy Lord Mayor

HF informed the Members that a Freedom of Information request has been received from RTE in relation to audit reports from 2015 to date.

Next meeting: 20th September, 2018.

The meeting concluded at 9.15 a.m.



Brendan Foster, Chairperson

Date: 20.9.2018

Appendix A

Actions agreed at this Audit Committee Meeting

- Action 1:** Chairperson to send a reminder to the CE, on behalf of the AC, requesting a full response in relation to the non-implementation of recommendations, to be forwarded to the AC in advance of their September AC meeting.
- Action 2:** HF to convey the appreciation of the AC to Councillor Noeleen Reilly, for her input to the work of the Audit Committee over the last four years.
- Action 3:** HF to investigate the possibility of sharing parking tags on mobile phones
- Action 4:** HF to query the accuracy of the annual maintenance cost of €158,000, estimated in the Audit Report on the Dodder Bridge project.
- Action 5:** KQ to raise the issue of the format of PSC reports at the CCMA meeting
- Action 6:** HF to convey to the Chief Executive that the Audit Committee asked that he attend the AC meetings more frequently

Appendix B

Actions agreed at the Audit Committee meeting held on 7th December 2017, and to be carried forward to the September, 2018 meeting.

Action 1: Arrange to submit a copy of Environment & Transportation Department's Risk Register to the AC, on completion of that Department's review with Ernst & Young (as a sample of a Risk Register for the AC)

Action 6: Submit AC's concerns to the Chief Executive re lack of clarity around Direct Labour element of this report, not possible to compare cost of works or time involved for Direct Labour work against work carried out by Contractors. To report back to AC by mid-2018

Actions agreed at the Audit Committee meeting held on 8th March, 2018, and to be carried forward to the September, 2018 meeting.

Action 1: Brief note to the Audit Committee on the use of Performance Indicators, by DCC Management

Action 2: HF to submit a strongly worded letter to CE, on the AC's behalf, requesting a response, including a detailed implementation plan in relation to the recommendations, with response to be forwarded by the CE by the end of March.